Anti-Corruption Online Tools: Online Monitoring systems against corruption in Latin America

Ricardo Matheus¹
José Carlos Vaz²
Manuella Maia Ribeiro³

Abstract: Since the introduction of computers and the emergence of electronic government in Latin American countries, especially the construction of tools for financial control and revenue in the state, popular participation and social control has been done in a background role of governmental actions. However, currently, we have discovered interesting experience in this area and we can see emerging new forms created to built and implement a channel where the society can help to combat the corruption through sending information about crimes and bias via internet. The study highlights experiences of several Latin American countries which have opted to implement the anti-corruption web as a tool of anti-corruption. We will study and compare them to identify what level of effectiveness of this tool in terms of expansion of spaces and participatory involvement of social actors against the corruption. As product is presented a comparison between the various monitoring systems and their limits and challenges of improving, so that other states and even states studied, can be guided by our studies on online monitoring systems against corruption in Latin America.

Special thanks to Open Society Foundations for their support in the presentation at First Global Conference on Transparency Research, Rutgers University, Newark, May 19-20, 2011.

¹ Bachellor in Public Policy Management and Master of Science at University of São Paulo (USP), Brazil. Professor at Foundantion and School of Commerce Alvares Penteado. (FECAP). E-mail: ricardomatheus@gmail.com.
² Bachellor in Business Administration at USP, Master of Science and Doctor of Philosophy at Getúlio Vargas Foundation (FGV). Professor at USP. E-mail: vaz@usp.br.
³ Bachellor in Public Policy Management at USP and Master of Science at FGV. E-mail: maiamanuella@gmail.com.
1. Introduction

The introduction of information and communication technologies (ICTs) in public administration was an important step toward improving processes, service delivery and also the participation and social control. Most recent articles focuses on the possibilities of ICT as a promoter of management improvements, however, several initiatives in the world and Latin America show that some locations are creating innovative ways to use ICTs to promote transparency of data and government actions, which expand the possibilities of social control and fighting corruption.

This use of ICTs within government is often called electronic government (e-gov). It is important to note that there is no consensus for specific e-gov, but to take this study as a condition that the use of ICTs for improving internal processes and service delivery is a basic condition of electronic government. We will deepen this condition within the theoretical framework on e-gov. However, some researchers point to the use of ICTs for social purposes, such as citizen participation, transparency and social control is called e-governance. The e-governance, therefore, reflects the optimization of information networks and gaining a better management of information flow to citizens and companies offer and, neatly, push. And e-governance was characterized as the promise of wider interaction with citizens, and always focused on delivering services, which leads us to believe that we will inevitably develop an electronic democracy (JUNIOR & ROVER, 2007).

Through exploratory research, contact with social networks of researchers and literature search, we could find many initiatives in Latin America that ICT is used as promoter of transparency, oversight and fighting corruption. Through cameras, portals and specific transparent channels of access to government information which is not static, we will describe these initiatives and create an analysis according to the literature on the subject. This required creating a historical context of politics, society and economy of local villages to facilitate the understanding of the reasons and the main reasons these initiatives are located in certain areas, or not. Thus it was also necessary to create a theoretical
framework that would guide the study and analysis of each initiative, describing its limitations and challenges.

2. Literature Review

2.1. Politics and Economy in Latin America: State Reform in Latin America

Unlike the current scenario in which there is the economic and political stability, in most countries of Latin America, its recent constructions were troubled and unstable. The economic crisis generated by the shock of oil prices during the 70s and 80s meant that Latin America was suffering economically and socially their effects (Zettelmeyer, 2006) these decades and especially in the 90s. This was a time when there was opportunity for the nation states that used the Weberian bureaucratic model (Weber, 1979) as a model of governmental structure going to introduce something called the management model or 'New Public Management' (Barzelay, 2001, 2000, 1992, Dunleavy & Hood, 1994 Hood, 1995).

In the developed countries, United States was the pioneer of reforms. In 1993, Bill Clinton, through the National Performance Review (NPR), inspired by reading a best seller by Osborne and Gaebler, proposed to reform the U.S. State. The results were surprising and during the first presidential term the government saved 177 billion, which link 31 billion and is certainly due to the recommendations made by American researchers (Osborne & Gaebler, 1995).

Following in the footsteps of Anglo-Saxon countries like Britain and the United States, Latin American countries have opted for these reforms to achieve greater efficiency in processes, budget cuts to improve public spending, creation of performance assessment and other strategies acquired (OSBORNE & GAEBLER, 1995). These reforms made by national states were characterized as a neo-liberal movement, especially the tax hike to contain inflation and reduce the state by selling shares of public enterprises and public policy processes (BAER & MALONEY, 1997, MESA-LAGO, 1997, 2000, MARINI, 2002, 2004).
Comparison of Weberian bureaucracy and New Public Management

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Weberian bureaucratic model</th>
<th>New Public Management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public interest</td>
<td>Results for Citizens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficiency, equity</td>
<td>Quality Control and Value Added Flexibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administration</td>
<td>Production</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expertise, formal authority and structure</td>
<td>Mission, and return services to consumers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Force the responsibility</td>
<td>Construct <em>accountability</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follow rules and procedures</td>
<td>Identify and solve problems, continuous improvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operate administrative systems</td>
<td>Separate control service</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1
Source: (BARZELAY, 1992: 119)

Despite the many advances in the economy of public resources, it is clear that the new public management has not advanced in sectors such as the effectiveness of public spending, especially when we see social areas such as health, education and social spending. While infrastructure areas such as highway construction, fiscal tightening, and production of procurement policies overhaul of internal processes, the state was able to reduce costs. This is partly because the public agenda of governments, which first bothered to stabilize the economy through the reinvention of the state, being in the background to restructure the health, education and social spending, such as social security. While some areas of government have modernized, many parts of these social areas, or even completely, follow a line of reasoning of the Weberian bureaucratic model.

2.1.1. State Reform in Costa Rica

Costa Rica is a country located in Central America with a high human development index (rank 62) and has about 4.5 million people and a GDP of 30 billion dollars. This is one of Latin American countries in which they were found some government initiatives related to systems for online monitoring corruption. Thus it was felt providential encounter
data and historical facts for the reader to contextualize and better understand under what circumstances and environments were taken certain measures. Firstly it is worth noting that like the rest of Latin America Costa Rica also had its conversion to democracy recently, through a series of dictatorship, repression environments shaping civil rights instituted by the military in power (FONT FABREGAS, 1998).

In this special case the political transition was merged with the economic reshaping of the National State (ROMERO-PEREZ, 2004). This point means that structural reforms aimed at implementing a managerial government were similar to the process of democratization of the country, generating, for example, conflict of public calendars, because after all, what was before, since the small universe of possibilities of action state?

This crisis agenda has often been pointed out by a scholar of the area as a crisis of governance within the state, hampering the implementation of various government projects and reducing the capacity of state governance as for the population, generating dissatisfaction and decrease the credibility of government action (CARBALLO, 2001, HOMEDIR & Ugalde, 2002). However, it is worth noting that some local government areas were first on the public agenda and achieved prominence subsumed implementation and evaluation, as economic reform and some units of government, such as health, unlike criticized state reform (Oszlak, 1999, VEGA CARBALLOS, 2001, GUTIÉRREZ SAXE, 2003). This points to the analysis of Evans (1996), verifying distortions in a nation-state as a solution in some areas and sometimes as a problem in certain departments.

2.1.2. State Reform in Ecuador

Ecuador is a country that lies north of the South American continent. It has a population of 14.5 million people, with a GDP of 120 billion dollars. The human development indicators point to high development (rank 77). Ecuador is another nation state that has suffered historical process and socioeconomic status similar to that of Costa Rica. Before the late democratization in the mid-80s, Ecuador experienced a period of dictatorship after the repression of civil rights of the majority population. Many economic
plans were implemented, however, without significant success (OSZLAK, 1999). The Constitutional Reform occurred similarly to the democratization process and also of the management reform of the National State (BASABE-SERRANO, 2009).

Some authors suggest that national reforms of the Ecuadorian state served as a guarantee for that Ecuador could reach levels of government to align the development of economic reform that was being planned (HAGGARD, 1995, ASSIES, 2003, ASSIES et al, 2002). Nevertheless, it is important to stress again that some social areas have not had good results, especially since they were in the background for these reforms. It was necessary first to ensure the quality of economic restructuring and then intervene as aggressively in the areas of health, education and social spending such as pensions and social assistance (Franco-Giraldo et al, 2006), verifying again the distortions in that a country may be, according to the theories of Evans (1996), in a national state as a solution in some situations and other times as a problem.

2.1.3. State Reform in Mexico

Mexico is a Latin American country that lies south of the North American continent. It has a population of 113 million people, with high human development index (rank 56) and gross domestic product of US$ 1 trillion. In Mexico state reform in Mexico was nothing more than a metaphor instrumental for economic reform were implemented. The changing priorities and working model of the State appeared to favor the formation of a new economy, focused on economic reform. The combination of measures of economic stabilization, structural adjustment and real adjustment of state activities represent a large package of State Reform (ROMERO-PEREZ, 2004).

It is worth noting that Mexico also had historical moments like Costa Rica and Ecuador. Experienced military dictatorships, however, the process of democratization came after the restructuring process and state of the economy (SOSA, 2000, REBOLLEDOD, 1993, MESA-LAGO, 2000). Thus, it is interesting to note that a fundamental law of our studies in Mexico was the Transparency Act of 2000, very new. Therefore, we will deepen
the information on this bill below, outlining a small part in this historical context of democratization and state reform in Mexico.

2.1.3.1. Transparency Law of Mexico

The federal law on transparency and access to information from the Mexican government (MEXICO, 2002) is fundamental to understand the models that Mexico presents this because there is a need for standardization and municipalities, states and federal agencies make portals of transparency and easy access models government information (VAZQUES, 2008). This law was one of the pioneers in the developing world, which gives some value to Mexico, a country that presents some interesting proposals to combat corruption through the dissemination of information through portals, creativity in building web applications for citizen participation in combating corruption and other models.

2.1.4. State Reform in Brazil

Brazil is a country located in the South American continent, with a population of 190 million inhabitants, gross domestic product of US$ 2 trillion and high human development index (rank 73). In Brazil, the State Reform in Brazil was one of the major movements in search of improving the modern bureaucracy, construction of WEBER (1979), not override it. Bresser-Pereira and Cunil-Grau (1999) reported that the Reform of Public Management, between 1995 and 1998 in Brazil did not underestimate the patrimonial and clientelist elements (NUNES, 2003) still exist in a state like Brazil, however, does not allow the sole concern in this object, as opposed to the restructuring of government in the 30s.

It is worth noting that in Brazil the first major reform of the state comes up with the DASP (Department of Public Administration) during the government of Getulio Vargas in the 30s. Harmed by the influence of economists throughout the twentieth century, the Brazilian government was not the scene of major studies for the promotion of social
development, developmental vision and just purely economic efficiency, as well as RABBIT (2006: 70) points in the lethargy of studies and establishment of academies and graduations in the area of public administration in the country.

As the reform of 30, the reform of the 90s in Brazil had the assumption that the best way to combat other forms of ‘clientelism’ (NUNES, 2003) and state capture is a step forward and make the state more efficient and more modern (BRESSER-PEREIRA & CUNIL-GRAU, 1999). Thus, only just after the democratization of the country and the need to professionalize the public bureaucracy to achieve the principles of reform of the state is emerging careers, positions, and selection process that culminated in the emergence of various courses of public administration in the country and you can then create solutions to sectorial areas have not yet upgraded (MATHEUS, 2009, MATHEUS & RIBEIRO, 2009, MARINI, 2002, PACHECO, 2000).

Herein, during the 2000s was the introduction of striking new public management techniques, enabled by the established management reform in the 90s and the professionalization of certain local government areas. The inclusion of new social technologies in the production of public policies and business process reengineering of the public bureaucracy and other goodies, the government comes to introducing e-government, a theme noted by other authors (MATIAS-PEREIRA, 2002, 2004).

Despite the many advances in the economy of public resources, the new public management has not advanced in sectors such as the effectiveness of public spending. While infrastructure areas such as highway construction, fiscal tightening, production of procurement policies overhaul of internal processes, the state was able to reduce costs. However, like other Latin American countries described above, Brazil has developed areas facing the economy without having the same mechanism of modernization in areas such as health, education and social policy, including being one of the cases studied by Evans (1996), where it is observed in Brazil that there are 'islands of excellence' in certain government departments such as Finance and Treasury, while other areas have not yet reached levels of excellence and state modernization (CARDOSO, 1972).
As part of the solution of these problems, e-government was established, and the use of information and communication technologies (ICTs) to create the environment that could bring benefits, such as the inclusion of new actors - civil society and the private sector - in formulation, implementation and monitoring of social policies at the local level marks an important turning against the pattern of state action in the social field in the country (FARAH, 2001). The opening of national policy for social participation in the 2000s is one of the highlights WALNUT (2004), which we believe is a key to the construction of public policies more efficient and effective, not only in Brazil but throughout Latin America.

2.2. Electronic Government

First we must point out that the E-Government is a concept still under construction (CAPELLA, 2008), often being confused with e-governance and computerization and use of ICTs by the government, without a specific plea (Cunha, 2005). Our study finds that electronic government is defined largely by the use of ICTs, especially the computerization of the public sector and using the Internet as a communication medium, but also uses other means of communication, not only focus on the use of computers (CHADWICK & MAY, 2003, NAVARRE & CORNFORD, 2006, VAZ, 2001, 2003b).


2.2.1. Electronic Government in Latin America
From now on, to summarize the general context of Latin America we opted for the Latin American cases were similar in the introduction of electronic government, as evidenced by several authors this issue (LAU, et al, 2008. Therefore, we will condition the theoretical references to Brazil; it is the country that has more publications and initiatives in electronic government and electronic governance. That does not disqualify or diminish the importance of initiatives in other Latin American countries like Argentina, Chile, Mexico, Costa Rica, Ecuador and more recently Colombia, Venezuela and Peru, but it must be clear that several of these countries have not been studied and there were no initiatives, which consider it prudent to focus on countries in which we are developing our studies, especially where knowledge is produced in the area to consultation and referral, facilitating the process of this paper.

2.2.1.1. Electronic Government in Brazil

As in most Latin American countries (LAU et al, 2008), Brazil, e-gov had her embryo with the computerization of the federal state apparatus in the 70s (Garcia et al, 2005, Diniz, 2009). During the 90s, we had the spread of commercial Internet in Brazil, with the emergence of a National Research Network and the early government websites in 1995 (JARDIM, 2000, 2005, MARCONDES & JARDIM, 2003), and in 1998 the Brazil already had a good network of services through the use of ICTs, such as electronic commerce (DINIZ, 2000), the delivery of income tax, access to government information (VAZ, 2003a) and a host of other services online (COELHO, 2001, CUNHA, 2004, FERRER & SANTOS, 2004, FERRER & BORGES, 2004, MEDEIROS, 2004, REINHARD & DIAS, 2005, FUGINI et al., 2005, JOIA, 2002).
### 2.3. Electronic Governance

From the electronic government concept being understood as a promoter of the rights of citizenship, such as social control, combating corruption and citizen participation, the State may extend the use of traditional e-government, based on process improvement and fiscal revenue economic, to expand the dialogue and meeting public expectations. This is when we went to e-governance, another concept that also is still no consensus prevailing in academia (SAXENA, 2005, GRANT, 2008, JAEGGER & THOMPSON, 2003, SHACKLETON et al., 2004, 2006, RILEY, 2001, CARLITZ & GUNN, 2002).

One of the issues found in the literature on the topic of e-governance are the possibilities and limits they have in making changes in the relationship between civil society and governmental sphere (SILVA 2005, BRAGA, 2007) In the literature on e-Governance Are generally divided into two groups regarding the use of ICTs in the relationship between government and society: the optimists and pessimists. Between these...
optimists, we can cite Lévy (1999). However the author points out that the use of ICTs will not solve all the problems of cultural and social world (LÉVY, 1999). Among them are those who believe in e-governance as a promoter of socioeconomic development, public management, increasing transparency and combating corruption, especially by means of citizen participation (REZENDE & FREY, 2005, MATHEUS, 2009, ROTHBERG, 2008, ARAÚJO & GOMES, 2004).

2.3.1. Electronic Governance in Latin America

In Latin America we also found a similar trend of global research. Although some authors point to certain spots, such as transparency, and fighting corruption, and citizen participation, all authors who deal with Latin America point to a certain optimism about the e-governance, especially for socioeconomic development, public management, increasing transparency and combating corruption, especially by means of citizen participation (PADGET, 2005, BASU, 2004, SLOMSKI & MELLO, 2010, HOSSAIN, 2005, FRICK, 2004, CELLARY, 2008, WELP, 2007, PEEL, 2009).

2.3.1.1. Electronic Governance in Brazil

In Brazil, e-Governance, according to Teixeira (2004, 2006), is related to improved quality, efficiency, effectiveness, transparency and oversight of government entities. Ribeiro (2008) points out that e-governance can go beyond the availability of government information. It can universalize the provision of public services and serving as an information channel and uninterrupted communication between the remote and public administration and population, with the advantage of promoting transparency, especially in the accounting area, as occurs in the portal of the Federal Government Transparency. And that e-governance was characterized as the promise of wider interaction with citizens, and always focused on delivering services, which leads us to believe that we will inevitably develop a so-called electronic democracy (JUNIOR & ROVER, 2007).
However, our concept "shows that e-governance is one of the impacts of the introduction of e-government successful, public management and offer a channel for dialogue of the population's demands and actions of government, with greater legitimacy, notably through the dissemination of information from all areas of public administration, with full public access to services provided by the Internet, cell phones, television and interact seamlessly and remotely, to promote substantial increase transparency, not only of the accounting reports of the Administration, but also the actions taken by all branches of government and administrative spheres of government.

In Brazil we say that there are some authors who focus their work in several areas of electronic governance. For some, e-governance facilitates interaction/communication between government and society (PRADO & LOUREIRO, 2006, CARDOSO apud PINHO, 2008, FREY, 2005, RIBEIRO, 2008). For others there is the possibility of democratization of the population even without this law (PRADO & LOUREIRO, 2006), as well as to strengthen local democracy (FREY, 2005). Meanwhile there are authors who intend to promote greater government transparency (PRADO & LOUREIRO, 2006, PINHO, 2008; WELP, 2007; FREY, 2005, RIBEIRO, 2008) and accountability of governments (PRADO & LOUREIRO, 2006, PINHO, 2008) As well as expanding the availability of public information (PRADO & LOUREIRO, 2006, PINHO, 2008) and opening new channels of participation spaces (WELP, 2007).

It is noteworthy that ICTs are still considered by the authors as promoters of change by its potential, i.e., despite several possibilities cited changes that provide e-governance does not necessarily mean that they are being held. In addition, there are few studies on the use of ICTs to improve the functioning of democratic political system (WELP, 2007).

Pinho (2008), for example, has conducted research on ICTs and democracy in those parts of the Brazilian capitals and found no functionality of electronic participation in the formulation of public policies on those websites. For the author, the technology for virtual participation already exist, then the problem is not technology for the use of ICTs for the promotion of social control, transparency and participation in public management. Pinho (2008) cites the difficulty for the actual realization of electronic governance to the existence
of some problems that occur in the real world as the issue of citizen participation and a culture of transparency are also difficulties in the virtual world. In short, the problem was not technological, but the current political culture.

2.3.2. Electronic Governance and the promotion of rights of social control of public management

The right to social control of public management refers to monitoring the formulation of policies and government initiatives by citizens and their organizations. This category of rights creates conditions for the establishment of trust between rulers and ruled, and gives legitimacy to the actions of the latter (VAZ, 2001).

The initiatives are related to these rights are the checks and balances and the disclosure of government activities. The right to social control depends crucially on access and availability of government information, or is directly related to the right to public information. The experiences found in this category can monitor, assess and monitor government performance. For example, the publication of financial statements, reports on activities of public institutions, progress of works and dissemination of bidding (VAZ, 2003a).

With the use of ICTs the right to social control of government can be promoted by the possibility of facilitating access to information, especially using the Internet. The Internet is a fast, relatively inexpensive and easy to use that enhances the promotion of this right. Examples of using ICTs to promote this right may be cited: the dissemination of government information over the internet, sending through the provision of listed phone via text message, the complaint online, among others.

2.3.3. Combating Corruption, Transparency, Accountability and Social Control

The theme of fighting corruption, transparency, oversight and accountability are closely linked. No doubt that transparency can generate a significant increase in social
control by citizens, thus hindering some deviations and biases of Public Management, such as corruption and ‘clientelism’ (NUNES, 2003). Thus, through social control easier, the citizen would exercise more and better their right of participation and accountability of actions and accounts of government (MICHAEL, 2005). Although we believe that these concepts are inseparable, this article divides the four concepts into smaller, more detailed chapters, entitled Anti-corruption, transparency, accountability and social control, trying to get better division of the references and definitions of the concepts proposed and studied.

2.3.3.1 Fighting Corruption

Combating corruption in Brazil has gained great prominence through increased surveillance of domestic institutions of government as the comptroller General's Office and the Audit Courts throughout Brazil, as well as points TREVISAN et al (2003). Despite evolution of fighting corruption in these instances, the authors describe that popular participation is essential to curbing corruption, a concept which we believe is also in line with our expectations, and social control and accountability, there is no really diminish the maximum all the deviations and acts of corruption within the country.

ICTs, particularly the Internet, may increase the potential for transparency in basic processes made by e-gov. According to Camerer (2006), the proper use of information is the best vaccine to combat corruption. So there is no doubt that the Anti-Corruption Tools Online does not resolve the problem of corruption, but will certainly fight them. We reaffirm the role of other institutions such as the Comptroller General's Office and the Court of Audit, as major allied agencies to promote the fight against corruption through their respective legal and administrative.

KAUFMANN (2002) recommends the wide dissemination of these tools online that can provide the empowerment of political decisions, and we anticipate that the online public consultation can perform this role of offering space and 'voice' in public policy debates subnational and even national As exemplified with regulatory agencies and ministries of Brazil.
1.1.1.1. Social Control and Accountability

This article will understand how the concept of social control the way in which the company directly control the state, adding branches and alternative institutions such as the comptroller and internal Audit Courts. Brazil recently drafted a law called the Statute of the City (Law 10257) that projects the population participate in the decision of public administration, according to the guidelines of the City Master Plan (RIBEIRO, 2008).

However, we should point out that there is still a difficulty to implement systems of citizen participation due to bureaucracy and lack of culture of citizen participation in the country, but internationally recognized as the Digital Participatory Budget in Belo Horizonte (PEIXOTO, 2008). Exactly what pointed Campos (1990) two decades ago, wondering when Brazil could actually have citizen participation to promote social control and accountability.

We also question the public administrators about his actions, as we point accountability, referring to the provision of accounts and definitions of the objects of actions. However, this action a citizen needs information, to question their leaders. AKUTSU (2005) emphasizes the interdependence between social control and accountability, being essential to the transparency of decisions of public officials. Nevertheless, it is shown that the administration acted with economy, efficiency and honesty.

2.3.3.2 Transparency

The concept of transparency can be understood in two aspects according to Ribeiro (2008). The first indicates the concept of transparency as a synonym for publicity, and the second as transparency and the availability of data, considering the transparency with data access, digital inclusion and availability of data, particularly regarding the frequency and timeliness of information contained portals and government sites, according to the words mentioned by VAZ (2003b), recognizing the information as a public right of every citizen.
Furthermore, some authors suggest there is no reason why public managers do not have their acts, accounts and information content without confidentiality are not available for the population (SPECK, 2004).

Obviously, there is a rule on advertising for acts of administration, provided for in the Constitution that allow for confidentiality of certain information especially essential to the security of society and the state, such as cases of national security, law enforcement investigations or interests of the Directors. Therefore, we believe that the true meaning of transparency is the opening of the supply of information, free and universal access, constant update, posted to a single channel of communication and interaction with citizens and with search tool to help citizens find the theme you want fast.

2.3.3.3 Citizen Participation and Electronic Democracy

According to some authors, participation in public consultations online requires a little knowledge and information, especially for the support of the hypothesis suggests that the citizen (BERTI, 2009). The author claims that this makes the environment more consistent and can promote a society in relevant context.

However, we believe that although the analysis with a scientific nature, or based on facts and statistics, we can take into consideration that citizens have the right to raise issues pertaining to social reality. E-government can lead to increased citizen participation and participatory democracy through the principles studied here, as social control, transparency (Mello, 2008).

Quite the contrary, we can point VAZ (2005) suggests that the public's right to be heard by governments. That we would characterize as more collaborative democracy, listening and, of course, filtering the demands of society. However, the tool online public consultation is one element that can indeed improve society participation in the development of programs, laws and various other matters that the Brazilian government has historically done without consulting the public (PINHO, 2008).

DAVIES (2007) suggests that ICTs have come so that citizens could come together and form groups to discuss public policy forums and legitimizing and facilitating
interaction within communities, especially in sub-areas. FRICK (2005) points to several international examples of good use of public consultations online, online forums and other tools for citizen participation through a model of electronic democracy.

2.4. Anti-Corruption Online Tools

2.4.1. Online Monitoring Systems

This paper considers that the complaint is understood as the online delivery of information via electronic forms or through electronic mail, to combat corruption (FRICK, 2004, MATHEUS, 2009, MATHEUS & RIBEIRO, 2009). The complaint in this online survey is being perceived as sending the complaint to the government via electronic form or through an online based web platform. In Latin America the most common kind of form is via electronic mail, however, several let through telephone and mail (MATHEUS, 2009, MATHEUS & RIBEIRO, 2009).

2.4.2. Anti-Corruption Online Tools of Supreme Audits of Brazil

Tools Online Anti-Corruption may be defined, briefly, for programs that provide information, graphics, interactive maps and other modern means earned by the use of ICTs in governmental websites allowing people to run the social control of the actions of government (MATHEUS, 2009, MATHEUS & RIBEIRO, 2009, MORAES, 2006).

3. Methodology

Our methodology assumes that a previous survey about the public consultations online tools and anti-corruption was made by discovering the current state of the Art and prominent cases in Brazil, both at national and subnational levels. So our search begins at the point of the analysis of anti-corruption tools of SASs, especially the states of Mato Grosso, Paraíba, Piauí and Paraná.
Furthermore, we focused on exploratory analysis of the anti-corruption online tools in Latin America and decided to highlights the best practices we found. After this initial step was accomplished, we searched literature references in the area. So that, we could answer some of our questions in the research. Thus, qualitative analysis produced by the reflection of the reading of literature specializing in e-gov, transparency promotion, social control and combating corruption. The results are in the final considerations, highlighting the positive and negatives aspects of anti-corruption online tools and proposing new ideas and solutions for problems we found in the exploratory and qualitative analyses, in according with our literature research in the area.

Therefore, we'll redo the exploratory research, revisiting all the Anti-Corruption Online Tools to confirm old assumptions of challenges, and perhaps find new limitations after two years from the first exploratory research in 2008. Through this we will propose solutions to improve the tools and public consultations, especially in terms of citizen participation, trying to expand the model of citizen participation, social control and access to government information. Are these the basic precepts of citizens’ rights that we use as our theoretical framework.

Thus, it was felt necessary to construct a literature review on the issues involved in the theme, and thorough studies on the references of the themes of Electronic Government, Transparency, Fighting Corruption, Social Control and Participatory Democracy and Citizen Participation. Moreover, the construction of legal reference, with the main laws which changed the duties and responsibilities of SASs.

Since there was the opportunity for a graduate of these tools was organized table with degree levels, each with certain desired characteristics to meet that level. Thus we could get a degree and see what the State of the Art according to our conceptions of quality. From this we can draw some conclusions, both qualitative and quantitative. And so we have tables and graphs summarizing our study.

4. Results and Analyses

4.1. Descriptive results of Online Monitoring Systems of Latin America
Among the possibilities of the use of ITCs by governments, their use for combating corruption is evident. We analyzed four innovative web tools at local level in several countries of Latin America. But the experiences studied need to develop several points, like the access of the information and receive protocol to check the status of his denounce. Currently the definition of transparency is limited to offer for the citizen the numbers of Public Administration, but is necessary to think about the level of transparency that is really necessary for the citizen produce social control and improve our democracy, combating the corruption in all the government spheres. The transparency of government must go beyond advertising data by the government, looking for a translating into graphics and basic words, enough to be understandable for all the citizens in the society.

4.1.1. Denuncie la corrupción (Xalapa, México)

Guadalajara is a city with 1.646.183 inhabitants in Mexico. The city had built an anti-corruption online tool called Denuncie la corrupción, with the objectives of promoting the social control through sent information about corruption by an electronic formulary. This action can combat the corruption through the sent of information containing corruption information. Every citizen can sent any information about corruption cases. If it is the desire, they can send the information anonymously. Nevertheless, the portal of the municipality does not send any kind of protocol or show information about the status of your process. Some indicators had been created to see how the online tool has been used by the population. The link is: http://enlinea.guadalajara.gob.mx/sim/indicadores.asp. Also, complementing that information, they created some graphics for citizens: http://enlinea.guadalajara.gob.mx/sim/infoindicador.asp?cd=614.

4.1.2. Denuncia Corrupción (Guadalajara, México)
Directed by the authorities of the Municipal Controller at the city of Guadalajara, the anti-corruption online tool Denuncia Corrupción is currently helping a municipality with around 1.7 million people to combat the corruption. The website address is http://www.guadalajara.gob.mx/consejos/consejoT/denuncias.asp. The main difference of that tool is the anonymously that you acquire if the citizen sent a lot of information and data that the municipality considers important and essential for the process. But it is a right of the citizen to be anonymously without sending a lot of information, because sometimes people could not have all the data or any kind of information but it could be a link to connect problems to their cause. No doubt the online tool is very important in combating corruption through the social control from the civil organized society; however, it is not enough. The Denuncia Corrupción could be more attractive if a few questions were asked and the anonymously being a right of the people, not like any kind of gift from the maximum of information sent. Probably we will see scenario with more information would be sent with fewer requisites from the municipality.

4.1.3. Denuncia en línea (Guayaquil, Equador)

Another online tool from Latin America is Denuncia en Línea built on the city of Guayaquil, Equador. The Municipality is one of the biggest in the country, with population around 2 million people. The tools´ website is http://www.guayaquil.gov.ec/denunciaslinea/FormularioDenuncias.aspx. Like the others tool is remarkable the no sense for transparency with the data and information sent by some citizen for combat corruption in Guayaquil. Without any kind of protocol and a section with the report of the results from all the processes that were reported by citizen the website tool is not yet perfect if we measure (MATHEUS & RIBEIRO, 2009).

4.1.4. Investigación y Análisis (Cartago, Costa Rica)
The municipality of Cartago at Costa Rica is one of the online tools that promote the corruption combat for the citizens. Information from 2007, the city has just 167 thousand people. The online address is the link: http://www.muni-cartago.go.cr/paginas/ENG/1024/contralo.html. Even as the other tools found, Investigación y Análisis can promote the social control and another benefits like the population possibility in combating corruption and the rise of the citizen report corruption online. In the other hand, the tool does not have transparency for people who tried to send some information for the municipality. It is a problem that must be solved with the introduction of protocol and transparency in the results, like posting it online in a section of the municipality website. If it is not possible, some information could send for an online address (e-mail), postal mail, by telephone or messages in a mobile phone.

4.2. Descriptive results of Anti-Corruption Online Tools of Supreme Audit States (SAS) of Brazil

In this section we show the result of the analysis of systems Online Tools Anti-Corruption of TCEs of some States that had such systems tools. This result comes from previous research done among all Brazilians SASs.

4.2.1. The SAS of Mato Grosso and the GEO-Obras Tools

The SAS of Mato Grosso is one of Supreme Audit most advanced in the area of promoting the transparency of data from the municipalities and the state, especially in the area of the industry works. Introducing an anti-corruption online innovator in public works, the SAS of Mato Grosso available to its citizens GEO-Obras, a promising system in social control and fighting corruption as it provides public notices, photographs, maps, search option by type of work, city and state of the work. Another positive point is the tool found in this section called the ombudsman, which can be triggered by citizen participation,
controlling the actions of public administration in the state. To learn more about this tool TEC Mato Grosso, it is available at: http://geoobras.tce.mt.gov.br/cidadao/.

4.2.1.1. The SAS of Paraíba and the “SAGRES” Tool

The SAS Paraíba is one of the Courts of Auditors, which achieved a good level of transparency of data and information from the State and the Municipalities of Paraíba. The anti-corruption tool called SAGRES online is one of the innovations in TEC of Paraíba and provides citizens with information of revenues, expenditures, commitments and lenders at a single site, and also a search tool that can be done through data as the year, Municipality and other categories, showing the complexity of the tool online. The portal is available to citizens SAGRES page http://sagres.tce.pb.gov.br/estado_empenhos01.php.

4.2.1.2. The SAS of Piauí and the “OBRAS-WEB” Tool

Standing out in the National scene, the SAS of Piauí, is a court of Auditors has also advanced in the area of transparency of information and use of ICTs, emerging standards and outdated static pages with no interactivity or search system to the citizen.

The anti-corruption tool WEB WORKS is a breakthrough in the area of transparency, together with other programs studied in this work. For example, there is a search engine that can find work throughout the state, reporting data, the individual nature of the works, the value of the contract and even state of the work.

As a challenge to improve the tool, which is worth to highlight the inclusion of an area of ombudsman, thus offering the power of citizen participation, channeling complaints in one place and instructing citizens to contribute in combating corruption in public Administration.

4.2.1.3 The SAS of Paraná and the “Obras Públicas” Tool
The SAS is one of Parana of Supreme Audit Brazilians who valued the use of ICTs to promote transparency of data and information concerning their works done by the government. This appreciation led to the creation of anti-corruption tool called the Public Works, where the citizen can know the status of state and municipal works, made from the use of public money in the state. The link to access the tool: http://www.controlesocial.pr.gov.br/ObrasPublicasConsultar.aspx.

As challenges to improve this tool, we highlight the lack of an ombudsman for easy access to the tool, as in other TCEs and also a section in which there is photographic record, proving that the works were made and according to the notices, deadlines and guidelines established by the rules and laws of the State.

4.2.1.4 The scenario of Anti-Corruption Online Tools of Brazilians SAS

Thus, we have a scenario of little use of ICTs to promote transparency of data and information at a level of depth of information we put into our theoretical framework that does not meet the desired level to reach the entire population of the states involved. We made a summary table of state tools, the name given by the ECA for the tool and also a chart showing the status of states that have such a tool and which states do not use ICTs to promote transparency and offering the possibility of social control population:

Scenario Tools Anti-Corruption Online of TCEs in Brazil

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Name of Anti-Corruption Tool Online</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SAS of Mato Grosso</td>
<td>GEO-OBRAS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAS of Paraíba</td>
<td>SAGRES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAS of Piauí</td>
<td>OBRAS WEB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAS of Paraná</td>
<td>OBRAS PÚBLICAS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Elaborated by Ricardo Matheus (2009)
### 4.3. Anti-Corruption Online Tools of State Court of Accounts of Brazil

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pros</th>
<th>Cons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Use of Geocoding;  
• Tracking public policies and public works;  
• Possibility to increase transparency of data for social control citizen  
• Use ICT to promote citizen participation: Extension of models of tools aimed at helping citizens' participation in external control conducted by the SAS;  
• Although in its infancy, the use of new social technologies and multimodal to combat corruption, such as:  
  • Web Radio;  
  • Twitter;  
  • SMS to complaints and grievances;  
  • Ombudsmen Online;  
  • Multimodal channels of information;  
  • Cadastral surveys of municipalities and processes that are being judged;  
  • Provision of informational feedback regarding complaints;  
  • Providing information about the tax situation before the TBI of all municipalities in the state;  
  • Use of WEB TV online assistance for plenary sessions of TCEs  
  • Proposed establishment of the National Council of Supreme Audit: Standardization of decision making, evaluation and trials of accounts and processes, ultimately, who controls the controllers? | • Database of Online Tools Anti-Corruption is incipient. Not envision the integration of information and georeferencing of these data are already collected by the Courts of Auditors, as studied in LRF and other laws;  
• Works and services can be easily cataloged (photos, files, digital purchases and procurement) and broadcast channel does not exist for this purpose, only the ECA MT;  
• Withdrawn use of mobile technologies (although there is deep use of complaints, grievances and so on. via text messaging services and video messages and images;  
• Poor use of social technologies, such as twitter, only the TEC has a profile of Piauí in such communication portal;  
• Use bit-depth technology forums and blogs online, with discussion of controversial issues and cases of raised public interest, such as complaints made by the media and so on. and  
• Infrequent use of electronic media technologies, such as rádioweb system, RSS ‘feeds' and also other technologies that have already been assimilated by society. |
4.4. Limits and Challenges of Online Monitoring Systems in Latin America

Among the main limitations and challenges to improving Tools Online Anticorruption state courts of auditors can highlight the lack of integration of technology platforms and systems, such as photographs, interactive maps, PDF documents, spreadsheets and easy access to e-mail or phone number and address of the ombudsman, which could further enhance the work of these tools installed in some of Brazil controllers agencies. Among the universe of Brazilian cases studies, the state of Mato Grosso is one of the most complete systems studied, as it enables the citizen can have the information easily deployed platform solutions.

The challenges of improving the Anti-Corruption Online Tools of Brazilian cases are based on the production of programs that can increasingly expand their database, since the ideas are being implemented, fitting for the near future, to reconcile more databases have not included in the system for the production of thematic maps, graphs and other models to attract non-traditional society to control the public sector and the actions of government.

As an example of this database can highlight the transparency of the Portal, which has all the information about large projects such as the Bolsa Familia (income transfer program). However there is still no trace of these public policies georeferenced and can be pursued. Who undertake a project to that effect, have an anti-corruption online increasingly transparent and probably more efficient. By means of social control held by the citizen through more transparent information, the TEC will be helped and can probably find more irregularities and improves the use of public money thus preventing fraud, embezzlement and corruption within the public administration.

Despite some improvements in certain uses of the Internet-based technologies, we have not seen an intensive practices already adopted by society and the general market, such as social media (Twitter, for example), channels like blogs and discussion forums on certain situations or cases that come to the fore by the company, use of mobile
technologies, such as sending text messages and videos and pictures messages (SMS and MMS), and the use of Web 2.0 technologies, increasing the interaction between citizen and government, called e-governance.

5. Final Considerations

From the understanding by the public administration that the information is a civil right, the search for greater transparency must be the greatest extent possible. This means that the information in the case of electronic shopping, should not be played anyway in the Portal of the government only as "goodwill" or even because the legislation requires and therefore was considered as an example of transparency in government procurement. Even if a citizen does not want to see this information at any given time, it should be there by chance might be challenged at any time for all concerned.

The experiences of Transparency Portal appear to cover this concept of transparency than the principle of publicity. To determine the degree of transparency in the different public entities by the use of e-government would be interesting for a future study to construct an assessment tool to check the possibilities of increasing transparency, ie the construction of indexes that measure the different levels transparency which are government agencies. Should be cataloged the existing features and adding others in order to create a possibility of further increasing transparency in public sites.

ICTs, particularly the Internet, can increase the possibilities for increased transparency for government services in basic processes such as procurement and disbursement of resources, the facility can be accessed by anyone and anywhere. The benefits of increased transparency in the gates shown, for example, are as diverse as the promotion of citizenship rights, such as the right to social control of public administration.

However there are limitations, including the digital divide. Even if the government makes available all the site information about the different governments in a clear and accessible if the citizen does not have access to technology or field to use the same
capabilities to fight corruption will be invalid and the path to full citizenship digital will be missed.

Although the Audit Courts are traditional entities, currently undergo significant changes, either in their legal frameworks as well as in its modernization and intensive use of modern management techniques and ICT. These changes have opened opportunities for the setting of efficiency, transparency, social control and fighting corruption.

Regarding the most recent innovations in the structure of CT, this study examined further the computerized systems of control online. Through a search of the portals of all courts found some modernization initiatives using ICTs to promote social control and transparency of accounts and other public policies. The result proved that some courts have innovations that tend to incorporate, as well as geo-referenced information, pictures and even channels of complaint online. But the fact is that some courts have gone further than others in this requirement of creating a simple and direct channel for transparency and combating corruption through social control made directly by the population.

Importantly, previous studies on state courts of accounts have pointed to certain inequalities between the public agencies. While some state courts of auditors had a more modern apparatus, with the bureaucracy of higher education, others had no such institutional framework, favoring the incompatibility of operational capacity and meet the new requirements imposed by law and even civil society. Therefore, despite the efforts of PROMOEX, still recognize a great imbalance of staff and equipment that public cannot get results in the area of combating corruption and promoting transparency in this institutional problem, not by failure of law enforcement or political incompatibility of the state.

As already highlighted in the text, it was possible to establish connections between changes in constitutions imposed and even assignments of SASs. These legislative changes such as Law of Fiscal Responsability, brought new demands on SASs. Especially when blamed for overseeing all the organs and instruments of state government and municipal levels, i.e., a challenge that is being improved each year and as projects such as the Anti-Corruption Online Tools and the growing trend of building chat channels to promote transparency and social control made by the citizen are being built. This is due to the
importance that SASs was essentially the same after these revolutions in the legislation for monitoring and assessment of Brazil's public accounts.

Further study of the object, which were the tools of the Anti-Corruption Online SASs, electronic government and electronic governance and another series of studies on could not be left out because they were fundamental to building the theoretical framework, allowing a accurate observation that the e-government can influence the model of public administration we have in the future, as beyond saving, agility and other goodies coming from the introduction of e-government in other areas of public management, we can also improve service delivery public and the creation of a full and legitimate channel of communication between government and citizens for transparency and combating corruption.

Furthermore, our study demonstrates the promotion of change in perspective of social control and transparency and ease of inclusion of some political actors who do not currently have a "voice" to participate in decisions of public administration and also promote social control. It is recalled that some tools may often have a low level of demand on citizens, however, we must consider is that citizens have a right to information anytime you want, ie access to information should be universal and free entire population, regardless of their demand be higher or lower.

Another problem that must be overcome is the content of the information and data that should always be expanded and also have a constant update. Outdated sites can not offer some depth to the information that citizens may be controlling constantly the Public Administration.

Therefore, we can state that the initiatives studied here can, and should be an inspiration to all states and municipalities to produce from its peculiarities, models similar Tool Online Anti-Corruption and single channels for receiving complaints of corruption by society and providing information on government by promoting transparency of information and government actions.

Finally, we should acknowledge the contribution of this work, though more descriptive, for a better understanding of the Anti-Corruption Online tools and issues
related to the processes of social control and transparency of public data, such as accounts and policies public works, etc.

Furthermore, we must credit the advance of research in the modernization of courts of auditors state in Brazil. Because it is a very recent case, this work served to consolidate some data, find the State of the Art these online tools and also some data on the structure of the courts that are currently being implemented.

In fact, this study examined in more detail the technical and managerial aspects of the modernization process and timing issues gave less weight to the political aspects. Future work can proceed on this job, trying to measure the impacts of Anti-Corruption Online tools or even what the state of the art of all SASs on the issue of transparency, social control and promote practices that promote citizen participation to combating corruption, embezzlement and improper spending in public administration.

6. References


KAUFMAN, Ester. *E-democracia local en la gestión cotidiana de los servicios públicos: modelo asociativo (público – privado) de gobierno electrónico local*. In:


